A Call to Action

Creating Economic Opportunity for Bay Area Marginalized & Safety Net Communities

1 in 5 Bay Area residents lives in poverty, according to United Way. The next big challenge of creating a Sustainable Community Strategy for One Bay Area is to leverage $277 billion of public investment to create prosperity for all and economic opportunity for the region’s vulnerable populations.
Regional Approaches to Creating Economic Opportunities for Bay Area Marginalized and Safety Net Communities

A Call to Action

By Carl Anthony & M. Paloma Pavel, Breakthrough Communities, with Chris Schildt

The San Francisco Bay Area is home to both incredible wealth and poverty. In May 2012, Silicon Valley-based Facebook went public and raised $16 billion overnight. And yet, one in five Bay Area households earn inadequate incomes to meet basic necessities. This level of poverty and inequality hurts not only these families directly, but also the region’s overall economic competitiveness. Low-income communities and communities of color now live in communities all over the Bay Area, from Antioch to East Palo Alto. This changing regional geography of race and class makes it difficult for these communities to access the services and jobs that improve their access to opportunity.

These economic disparities are fundamentally regional in nature, and must be addressed at the regional level. To turn around these trends, existing actors will need to engage with new constituents to develop an inclusive regional economic development strategy. As the regional governance coordinating body, the Joint Policy Committee (JPC) and its member agencies – the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC), the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG), the Bay Area Air Quality Management District (BAAQMD), and the Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) – is uniquely positioned to create and implement strategies that promote economic development that benefits all people in the Bay Area.

Over the coming years, the JPC and its member agencies will have a unique opportunity to map out an economic development strategy for the region through a series of four separate planning processes. Plan Bay Area, with its coordination of transportation, land use, and housing planning at the regional level, will define the landscape of economic opportunities for decades to come; the plan is currently going through environmental review and will likely be adopted within the year, making it of important immediate focus for advocacy efforts. The Bay Area Economic Strategy Framework currently under development by the Bay Area Economic Institute for the JPC will also provide key insight into how to make our region more competitive. In addition to these two plans already

---

Principles of Equitable Economic Development

We envision a Bay Area region where:

- All people who want to work can find meaningful employment that provides a living wage and benefits;
- Workers can afford to choose to live near where they work, and have a variety of safe, affordable, and efficient options to get to and from work;
- Workers can access the services and shopping they need to succeed in the workplace, whether that is job training classes, affordable child care, or convenient places to buy food and other necessities; and
- Regional agencies work with a wide range of stakeholders to develop an economy that offers meaningful employment at a variety of skills and educational levels, without compromising local or global environmental, health, and workforce wellbeing.
under way, the Regional Prosperity Plan and the Bay Area Economic Impact Report, both co-coordinated by MTC and ABAG and to begin in the next year or so, have the potential to place economic inclusion for all Bay Area workers central to new regional planning around economic development, land use, housing, and transportation. These four regional plans must address how to create economic opportunities for low-income workers, people of color, women, and others who often face barriers in the economy. Working together, we can create economic opportunities for all and achieve United Way of the Bay Area’s goal to cut poverty in half by 2020.

Linking New Opportunities to Land Use, Transportation, and Infrastructure Planning

Unemployment is high in the Bay Area, particularly among African Americans, Latinos, youth, seniors, the formerly incarcerated, and immigrants. As the region slowly recovers from recession and moves towards a more just and sustainable economy, workers from old industries, such as prisons, will also need to find new jobs. Within the various planning processes for a new regional economy, five key linkages need to be developed to (1) create new jobs; (2) support worker education and training; (3) connect works to jobs; (4) increase access to capital for small businesses; and (5) build a robust social safety net to lift people and communities out of poverty. To do this successfully will require partnerships with constituents beyond the usual stakeholders. Below are each of these five areas, which new stakeholders need to be involved, and what we can achieve together.

1. Job creation and enterprise development

**Goal:** Regional planning efforts should support job growth in Priority Development Areas, sustainability corridors, and communities of concern, particularly small businesses and jobs in high opportunity sectors.

Job creation strategies should include both place-based and sector-based strategies. In Plan Bay Area, existing job creation opportunities within Priority Development Areas and corridors should be identified, particularly as they relate to the complete communities development model proposed in the plan. In addition, efforts should be made to support small, minority-owned and women-owned businesses and jobs in high opportunity sectors, described in more detail in the column to the right. Community Workforce Agreements and other targeted hiring policies should be used to ensure that workers from historically disadvantaged communities have a fair chance to compete for new

---

**Job Growth in High Opportunity Sectors Linked to Infrastructure Investment**

As the Bay Area moves forward with planning for an inclusive regional economy, we must support not just high tech industries, but also encourage job growth in the high opportunity sectors related to infrastructure investments made by regional agencies. These sectors usually offer quality jobs for middle-skill workers and have been pathways to the middle class for low-income people and people of color. Each of these sectors has its own set of constituents who should be engaged in regional economic development planning. More research is needed to identify and highlight the scale and character of these opportunities and the ways in which they can be realized.

**Health.** Projections show dramatic job growth in the health care industry in the coming decades. Implementation of the Affordable Care Act will lead to millions more Americans who will now be insured and in need of health care services. The Act itself commits $11 billion to community health centers around the country to expand their services in order to meet this new demand. This represents an important set of opportunities for an underemployed workforce and should be encouraged, particularly in Priority Development Areas and corridors.

**Food.** Many of the Priority Development Areas and corridors in the Bay Area are food deserts, lacking basic healthy food retail services. As measures to increase food access are implemented, such as the Healthy Food Financing Initiative to help open new grocery stores, there is an opportunity to simultaneously create new jobs in these neighborhoods.
jobs. For example, Missouri has created a state-wide strategy to ensure that low-income workers and women benefit from public investment in transportation by using targeted hiring practices, funding job training program, developing a pipeline to union membership, and creating state-level oversight to ensure compliance.

Key stakeholders include businesses and business community intermediaries, such as Inner City Advisors, LISC, and other business interests. Economic justice advocates such as EBASE, Working Partners USA, the UC Berkeley Labor Center, and unions should also be engaged to ensure the new jobs are quality jobs accessible to all workers.

2. Workforce development and career pipelines

Goal: Regional land use and transportation planning efforts should address existing skills gaps and work in conjunction with educational institutions to move low-income workers into career pipelines for better paying jobs.

As regional land use, transportation, and economic planning efforts help map out what types of jobs will be created in the future, planners will need to support workforce development efforts so that workers will be competitive for these jobs. Our existing educational institutions, from early childhood through college, are our best asset to train the next generation of workers. However, schools and school districts in the Bay Area are heavily segregated by both race and income. Regional land use planning should ensure all children have access to the education that will lead to a successful career pipeline, particularly in suburban communities that have seen an increase in poverty. In addition, workforce development programs should be supported to help current workers develop new skills to compete for emerging job opportunities.

Stakeholders representing educational institutions, including school districts, community colleges, universities, and technical training programs, will be central to regional planning efforts that support workforce development and career pipelines. Other key stakeholders include workforce development boards, unions, and early childhood education organizations such as First Five.

3. Connecting workers and jobs

Goal: Regional planning efforts should connect works and jobs, both physically through appropriate land use and transportation planning, and by working in conjunction with employment agencies to place workers in new jobs.

Workers should have access to a wide range of job opportunities in order to maximize their potential for success. This means both that they should have affordable housing options close to major employment centers, and that they should have affordable, safe, and reliable transportation choices to get from home to work and

---

**Job Growth in High Opportunity Sectors Linked to Infrastructure Investment (cont’d)**

**Construction and Manufacturing.** Although construction has been hit hard during this recession and manufacturing has been in decline for over a decade, both sectors offer good-paying jobs for middle-skill workers who may not have nor want a four-year college degree. And both have an aging workforce that will retire soon, opening up opportunities for younger workers. As the economic recovery continues, construction jobs will start to come back. In manufacturing, technological innovation is transforming the sector and potentially turning older industrial area of the region economic hubs. Many of these areas are in Priority Development Areas and corridors. Some organizations, such as the Bay Area Manufacturing Renaissance Council, have already started working with high schools to train the next generation of workers for these jobs.

**Education, Transit, and the Public Sector.** Workers in the public sector teach our children, drive our buses, and keep our parks clean and safe. They are the often unseen and underappreciated workforce that keeps our cities moving and contribute to our quality of life. Thanks in large part to tough enforcement of anti-discrimination laws and strong union contracts, the public sector has been a reliable path to the middle class for countless men and women of color. However, this sector has also faced large job losses as local, state, and federal governments have cut budgets. This sector should be supported, both for the stable, middle-class salaries it provides and for creating the jobs that make our cities such great places to live.
back home again. Workers should also be able to access job placement services in order to help them find the right employment options for their skills and interests.

Transit agencies and MTC can ensure that workers have multiple options to get to employment centers. They also need to work with job placement agencies and One Stop centers which work directly with residents to place them in jobs.

4. Access to capital investment

Goal: Regional agencies should address access to capital and other financial tools through coordination with community development financial institutions (CDFIs), particularly in Priority Development Areas and corridors.

Capital is a necessary ingredient to building a business or buying a home. Yet many low-income people and people of color continue to face discrimination in the lending industry, oftentimes offered less favorable loan terms or no loan at all. In order to support economic opportunities in Priority Development Areas and corridors, these regional plans should address barriers to access to capital. Community development financial institutions will be key stakeholders in this process.

5. Robust social safety net

Goal: Regional planning efforts should ensure that low-income households have access to the social services that they need in order to access economic opportunities.

Poverty has been growing in communities on the urban fringe of the Bay Area at a rate faster than the social services can keep up with. This has implications for both the economic security these constituents face, as well as regional planning efforts to increase economic opportunities for this population. Regional agencies should track the ways in which regional decision-making may exacerbate safety net issues for vulnerable communities. For example, land use decisions that result in displacement of low income populations may also contribute to homelessness. Regional agencies should institutionalize early warning systems and propose action alternatives in collaboration with safety net providers. Stakeholders include government and nonprofit service providers, and particularly centers that bring together multiple providers in one setting, such as United Way’s SparkPoint Centers.

Conclusion

The Bay Area is facing a wave of new investment as regional agencies shift their policies and resources towards sustainable development. According to Plan Bay Area’s own analysis, up to 1 in 3 already rent-burdened households living in communities of concern could be displaced by these new policies, raising questions of where these families will be displaced to and how they can be supported. Further, rising sea levels will impact many of the neighborhoods and communities where future growth is being planned for, even while the end of redevelopment and other budget challenges make it more difficult to find the resources to address these issues.

These challenges are also an opportunity. If we truly want to create a Bay Area for all, it must start with creating an economy that benefits all. This brief provides a framework for how we may begin this work. But in order to succeed, a wide range of stakeholders from throughout the region will need to work together to build a new economy with jobs for everyone, from older workers who are trying to hold onto their jobs to younger workers who are just entering the workforce, and from those who are highly skilled and job ready to those who may need more training or have barriers to employment. Businesses, unions, elected officials, government agencies, social justice and environmental advocates, academics, social service providers, financial institutions, and others must work together to first plan and then create an economy in which everyone benefits.
References

1 United Way of the Bay Area. 2009. “Struggling to Make Ends Meet in the Bay Area.”

Breakthrough Communities gratefully acknowledges the contribution of Chris Schildt in the preparation of this Call To Action.

Carl Anthony, founder of Breakthrough Communities, has served as Acting Director of the Community and Resource Development Unit at the Ford Foundation, responsible for the Foundation’s world wide programs in fields of Environment and Development, and Community Development. He directed the Foundation's Sustainable Metropolitan Communities Initiative and the Regional Equity Demonstration in the United States. Carl funded the national Conversation on Regional Equity (CORE), a dialogue of national policy analysts and advocates for new metropolitan racial justice strategies. He was Founder and, for 12 years Executive Director, of the Urban Habitat Program in the San Francisco Bay Area. With his colleague Luke Cole at the California Rural Legal Assistance Foundation, he founded and published the Race, Poverty and the Environment Journal, the only environmental justice periodical in the United States. He has a professional degree in architecture from Columbia University. In 1996, he was appointed Fellow at the Institute of Politics, John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University. His forthcoming book is titled The Earth, the City and the Hidden Narrative of Race.

Paloma Pavel, PhD, founder of Breakthrough Communities, is President of Earth House Center. She has served as Director of Strategic Communications for the Sustainable Metropolitan Communities Initiative at the Ford Foundation. Pavel’s academic background includes graduate study at the London School of Economics (LSE) and Harvard University. Her research at LSE addresses South African Economics in the pre- and post-Apartheid eras. Her dissertation (Organizational Culture and Leadership Development) was part of a five-year study by the Carnegie Foundation on the workplace in America, which culminated in the publication Good Work. Currently, she is visiting faculty at UC Davis and advisor to the Regional Advisory Committee. In Contra Costa County, Dr. Pavel serves on the Environmental Quality Commission and is the Vice President of the League of Women Voters. Dr. Pavel is editor of the newly released book entitled Breakthrough Communities: Sustainability and Justice in the Next American Metropolis (MIT

The mission of Breakthrough Communities is to build multiracial leadership for sustainable and metropolitan communities in California and the nation.

Contact: 510 652 2425 (tel) 510 595 7295 (fax) BreakthroughCommunities@gmail.com
Breakthrough Communities at Earth House Center 5275 Miles Ave. Oakland, CA  94618
Breakthrough Communities

Promoting Sustainability and Justice in Metropolitan Regions

Mission

The mission of Breakthrough Communities is to build multiracial and multiclass leadership for sustainable metropolitan communities in California and the USA. Breakthrough Communities works with the private sector, government officials, NGOs, community leaders, and faith-based groups to foster metropolitan regional equity. We promote innovative approaches and policies to ensure that all communities in a metropolitan region share equitably in its resources and opportunities in the present, and engage communities in planning for future generations.

Breakthrough Communities demonstrates that a viable economy, a healthy environment, and social equity are mutually reinforcing, and provide the framework for planning and resource allocation to achieve truly sustainable communities.

Programs

Breakthrough Communities offers the following services in support of its mission:

- **Civic Engagement.** Capacity building for individual and collective actions within communities, particularly disenfranchised communities, and communities of color, to address issues of public concern.

- **Leadership Development.** Enhancing the capacity of leaders and community members in creating a vision and strategy for the realization of shared goals through leadership workshops facilitated by Breakthrough Communities associates and tailored to the needs of your group.

- **Community Sustainability Strategies.** Collaborative development of integrated land use and transportation plans in support of community needs in the context of efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by alleviating reliance on the automobile.

- **Strategic Communications:** Using web, video, print and a variety of communications tools to create, strengthen, and link key audiences. We create media impact favorable to the attainment of community goals.

Publication

Our book Breakthrough Communities: Sustainability and Justice in the Next American Metropolis, features case studies of efforts underway in Detroit, New York City, San Francisco, New Orleans, Atlanta, Camden, Chicago, Los Angeles, and other metropolitan areas. It addresses such problems as accessible transportation, community food security, vacant property, brownfields, affordable housing, jobs and quality education, including linkages to climate change. Our advocacy toolkit includes Torrice Productions' PBS documentary “The New Metropolis”, as well as a leadership curriculum.